

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA
BEFORE THE DEPARTMENTAL APPEALS BOARD
CIVIL REMEDIES DIVISION
DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH AND HUMAN SERVICES

In the Case of:

Center for Tobacco Products,

Complainant,

v.

A & R Barash LLC
d/b/a Bottle Stop Drive-In,

Respondent.

**ADMINISTRATIVE COMPLAINT
FOR CIVIL MONEY PENALTIES**

FDA Docket No. FDA-2013-H-0440
CRD Docket No. C-13-651

INTRODUCTION

1. The Center for Tobacco Products (CTP), Food and Drug Administration (FDA), United States Department of Health and Human Services, seeks a civil money penalty (CMP) in the amount of \$2,000 from A & R Barash LLC d/b/a Bottle Stop Drive-In (Respondent) for violating the Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act (Act). Most recently during a two-part inspection of the establishment conducted on November 19 and 26, 2012, FDA-commissioned inspectors documented the following violations:
 - a. Selling tobacco products to a minor, in violation of 21 C.F.R. § 1140.14(a).

Specifically, a person younger than 18 years of age was able to purchase a package of Top Regular Superroll cigarette tobacco on November 19, 2012, at approximately 10:07 AM;

- b. Failing to verify the age of a person purchasing tobacco products by means of photographic identification containing the bearer's date of birth, as required by 21 C.F.R. § 1140.14(b)(1). Specifically, the minor's identification was not verified before the sale, as detailed above, on November 19, 2012, at approximately 10:07 AM; and
- c. Using a self-service display in a non-exempt facility, in violation of 21 C.F.R. § 1140.16(c).

Details regarding the case history are included in Paragraphs 8-10 below.

- 2. Respondent owns an establishment that sells tobacco products, which does business under the name Bottle Stop Drive-In, located at 474 South Arizona Boulevard, Coolidge, AZ 85128.

LEGAL AUTHORITY

- 3. FDA has the authority to seek civil money penalties from any person who violates a requirement of the Act related to tobacco products. 21 U.S.C. § 333(f)(9).
- 4. The Act prohibits the misbranding of a tobacco product while such product is held for sale after shipment of the product or its components in interstate commerce. 21 U.S.C. § 331(k).
- 5. A tobacco product is deemed to be misbranded if it is sold or distributed in violation of regulations issued under Section 906(d) of the Act (21 U.S.C. § 387f(d)). 21 U.S.C. § 387c(a)(7)(B); 21 C.F.R. § 1140.1(b).
- 6. The regulations at 21 C.F.R. Part 1140 were issued under Section 906(d) of the Act (21 U.S.C. § 387f(d)). Therefore, selling or distributing a tobacco product in violation of these regulations causes that tobacco product to be misbranded.

7. FDA has documented multiple violations of 21 C.F.R. Part 1140 at Respondent's establishment, as detailed below.

CASE HISTORY

8. FDA-commissioned inspectors have completed inspections of Respondent's establishment twice in a twenty-four month period. The inspectors documented violations during both inspections.
9. Previously, on April 19, 2012, CTP issued a Warning Letter to Bottle Stop Drive-In. The Warning Letter stated that an FDA-commissioned inspector observed a violation at the establishment on January 25, 2012, for using a self-service display "of cigarettes and smokeless tobacco in a facility not restricted to adults at all times," in violation of 21 C.F.R. § 1140.16(c). The Warning Letter stated that failure to correct the violation may result in a civil money penalty action, or other regulatory action by FDA. It also stated that Bottle Stop Drive-In must comply with the law, and that the letter may not be an exhaustive list of violations.
10. Initially, FDA did not receive a response to the Warning Letter. UPS records show that the Warning Letter was received on April 20, 2012, by "JJ." CTP sent Bottle Stop Drive-In a letter on August 1, 2012, stating CTP had not received a response to the Warning Letter and reminding Bottle Stop Drive-In of its continuing obligation to be in compliance with the Act and its implementing regulations. By letter, dated August 6, 2012, Antonio Barash, who identified himself as Owner of Bottle Stop Drive-In, responded on behalf of Respondent. Mr. Barash stated that all tobacco products were removed from the old location

and placed behind the counter, where no customers would be free to access the products.

PROPOSED PENALTY

11. Retailers who have violated regulations promulgated under section 906(d) of the Act (21 U.S.C. § 387f(d)) may incur a civil money penalty up to the amounts provided in the following table:

Number of Violations	Civil Money Penalty
1	\$0.00 w/ warning letter
2 within a 12 month period	\$250
3 within a 24 month period	\$500
4 within a 24 month period	\$2,000
5 within a 36 month period	\$5,000
6 within a 48 month period	\$10,000

See 21 C.F.R. § 17.2; Guidance for FDA and Tobacco Retailers, Civil Money

Penalties and No-Tobacco-Sale Orders for Tobacco Retailers, November 2012

(available at

<http://www.fda.gov/downloads/TobaccoProducts/GuidanceComplianceRegulatoryInformation/UCM252955.pdf>).

12. CTP requests that a civil money penalty in the amount of \$2,000 be assessed against Respondent for four violations of 21 C.F.R. Part 1140 within a twenty-four month period.

OPTIONS FOR RESPONDING TO COMPLAINT

13. Respondent must take one of the following three actions within the time listed below:
- a. Acknowledge that the violations occurred and pay the penalty: To pay the penalty, Respondent should follow the instructions detailed in the cover letter. The signed Acknowledgment Form must be received by CTP within 15 days after service of the Complaint. Following receipt of the signed Acknowledgment Form, CTP will contact Respondent to provide the payment instructions. Respondent should not send any payments to CTP before receiving the specific payment instructions from CTP.
 - b. File an Answer: Respondent has the right to request a hearing by filing an Answer within 30 days after service of the Complaint. The Answer shall be deemed to be a request for a hearing, unless the Answer states otherwise. The failure to file an Answer within 30 days after service of the Complaint may result in the imposition of the proposed civil money penalty. 21 C.F.R. § 17.11. Instructions for filing an Answer are listed in Paragraph 16. After filing an Answer, Respondent may choose to participate in discussions with FDA to try to reach a settlement.
 - c. Request an Extension: Respondent has the right to request an extension of time to file an Answer, for good cause. This request must be made within 30

days after service of the Complaint. Instructions for filing for an extension are listed in Paragraphs 19 and 20.

14. Respondent has the right, but is not required, to retain counsel for representation.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR FILING AN ANSWER TO REQUEST A HEARING

15. Rules for drafting and filing the Answer can be found at 21 C.F.R. § 17.9.
16. If filing an Answer, the Answer:
 - a. Must be filed with the Departmental Appeals Board, Civil Remedies Division, 330 Independence Ave., S.W., Cohen Building, Room G-644 (MS 6132), ATTN: FDA CMP, Washington, D.C. 20201. The Answer must include both the FDA Docket Number and CRD Docket Number which are found at the top of this document.
 - b. Must include the following:
 - i. Admission or denial of each of the allegations of liability found in this Complaint, including specifically the allegations in Paragraphs 1, 2, and 9-10. Allegations not specifically denied in the Answer will be considered admitted;
 - ii. All defenses on which Respondent intends to rely;
 - iii. All reasons (if any) why Respondent contends that the penalty should be less than the amount stated in Paragraph 12. Examples include: any retailer training program you have, any state penalty you paid for this alleged violation, or reasons you are unable to pay the penalty; and

- iv. The name, address, and telephone number of Respondent's counsel (if any). Other contact information, such as e-mail address, may be included.
- c. May also include the following:
 - i. Information (if any) regarding penalties paid to a State for the same violation(s) charged in this Complaint. FDA will consider this information for purposes of determining a civil money penalty.
Guidance for FDA and Tobacco Retailers, Civil Money Penalties and No-Tobacco-Sale Orders for Tobacco Retailers, November 2012.
 - ii. A request for an informal Settlement Conference to discuss reducing the penalty amount owed. Such a request must be filed as a part of the Answer, and is not an alternative to filing a complete Answer. If an informal Settlement Conference results in an agreed payment of a reduced penalty and written acknowledgment by the Respondent that the violations occurred, a hearing would no longer be necessary.
- 17. If, after the Answer is filed, Respondent needs to change the Answer, Respondent can do so by filing a motion with the Departmental Appeals Board, Civil Remedies Division, 330 Independence Ave., S.W., Cohen Building, Room G-644 (MS 6132), ATTN: FDA CMP, Washington, D.C. 20201. 21 C.F.R. § 17.9(d). The motion must include both the FDA Docket Number and CRD Docket Number which can be found at the top of this document.

18. The failure to file an Answer or make full payment within 30 days after service of the Complaint may result in the imposition of the proposed civil money penalty.

21 C.F.R. § 17.11.

INSTRUCTIONS FOR FILING A REQUEST FOR AN EXTENSION

19. Within 30 days after service of the Complaint, Respondent may request an extension of time to file an Answer. 21 C.F.R. § 17.9(c).
20. The request for an extension should be filed with the Departmental Appeals Board, Civil Remedies Division, 330 Independence Ave., S.W., Cohen Building, Room G-644 (MS 6132), ATTN: FDA CMP, Washington, D.C. 20201. The request must include both the FDA Docket Number and CRD Docket Number.
21. The Administrative Law Judge may grant Respondent up to 30 additional days to file an Answer, if good cause is shown. 21 C.F.R. § 17.9(c).

REQUEST FOR RELIEF

22. CTP respectfully requests that an order assessing a civil money penalty against Respondent in the amount of \$2,000 be entered.

DATED: April 17, 2013

Respectfully submitted,

/s/

Deeona Gaskin

Attorney for Complainant
Center for Tobacco Products
United States Food and Drug
Administration
10903 New Hampshire Avenue
WO 31, Room 4537
Silver Spring, MD 20993
240-402-5053
301-847-8636
deeona.gaskin@fda.hhs.gov